

Joint Council

I am not aware of it.

MR. LUCAS: Can you suggest any way by which the wage of unskilled Natives in Durban today can be improved ?- With regard to the unskilled wage, I think the wage determination could work very well. Europeans do not much care to do unskilled labour.

You think it is safe for unskilled labour, but not for skilled labour ?- Yes, it is safe for unskilled but not for skilled labour.

CHAIRMAN: With regard to the point which you made --
?- (MR. Makulisi): There was a time when the Railways displaced Natives by Europeans.

We are on wage determination now. The point which I want you to speak on is this. You raise the point that some of the employers force the Natives to work harder when they have to pay more. Do you think that is likely to happen in unskilled work when there is wage determination substantially raising the wages ?- No, because there is not much chance of Europeans going in for unskilled work.

Now, you said that the European employers made the Natives work harder and made one man do the work of three ?- Yes, that is what happened.

Is that likely to apply to unskilled work ?- No, I do not think so.

Why do you say that ?- Because the wage determination will be very low. It will be higher than it used to be, but it will not amount to £7 per month.

And, therefore, the employers will not really mind whether they get more efficiency out of it or not ?- They will consider quantity more than quality. You see, they want as many Natives as they can get.

Joint Council

They would not worry about a little extra expenditure? What effect do you think it is likely to have on the number of Natives who will come in from the rural areas to work here? Would not rather more of them tend to come in?— If there is an opening for them to be employed.

You never know whether there is going to be an opening until you have tried?— No, that is so.

Do you find here that the Native who is becoming a permanent resident of Durban is being undercut by the Native who comes in from outside?— I do not think so. Of course, the needs of a man from the outside are different from the man in Durban. The man who comes in from the outside has his land as well.

The man who lives here permanently has no such other resources and, therefore, he gets it in the neck every time?— Yes, that is so.

MR. MOSTERT: Apart from that, you have a strong opposition or competition so far as the town is concerned in the Indian?— Yes, at all times.

And you always have that here?— Yes.

I am now talking of unskilled and semi-skilled work?— Yes.

MAJOR ANDERSON: Do you not think that there is room for increased efficiency in unskilled work. Now, if higher wages are given, there will have to be a rise in efficiency?— Yes, and the man who produced the better goods should have preference.

I am talking of unskilled labour?— Cheap unskilled labour is nearly always inefficient labour.

MR. MOSTERT: For the extra money they should be able to do more work and better work?— Yes, and overtime work.

Joint Council

MAJOR ANDERSON: Not necessarily more work, but more intelligent work, too ?- Yes.

CHAIRMAN: I want to put this point to you, Mrs. Palmer. On the one side, I think you will admit that several statements put in, not only by yourself, but by the Joint Council, submit that the Native/^{rural} population which is, as the last witness has said, subsidised by their tribal holdings, is continually impinging on the permanent Native urban population so that the economic factors always tend towards dropping wages, especially for the unskilled workers. Now, on the other hand, if you bring in wage regulation, will there not be a tendency to draw in a considerable proportion of this rural population in the hope of getting these higher wages, with the result of a very considerable strain being put on any housing schemes that may be undertaken for the benefit of the permanent population.?- (Mrs. Palmer): Yes, that really could happen, but could that not be met by saying that no one would be admitted as a tenant into the Native village, unless he could prove that he had relatively permanent employment. If that could be done, you could keep the barracks for the others.

But ~~the~~^{would} not your barracks continually ^{be} undercutting and undermining the standard of living and wages and also attracting the raw Natives from outside ?- Well, the Natives from outside could not undercut if there were wage determination.

Would that not produce a very considerable strain on the carrying ability of the town ?- Yes, I think so.

I am told that even today in Durban, the wage determinations for Europeans are honoured in the breach. I do not

Joint Council

know whether that is so, but that is the statement made. If you have a relatively small urban population of Natives and a huge rural population who have to come in to earn something, who have to come in ^{to} ~~the~~ earn what you describe as pocket money, would not that mean that you would have a continuous strain on everything? - Yes, the whole position is extraordinarily difficult and complicated, but the way out is to increase that permanent population on a living wage. You might have to pass special administrative regulations to see that the persons do not flood in in order to get a bigger living wage here than elsewhere. But these precautions could be taken.

DR. ROBERTS: Do you visualise a time when you will have a large constant population here and a very small intermittent population? - I should hope that that would come and I think the policy should be directed to that, but it will take some time.

CHAIRMAN: In other words, your solution of the urban problem lies in the country, in creating conditions which will stem the flow? - Yes.

In the meantime, that is not going to be done in a year or so and, in the meantime, you suggest administrative action to prevent an influx. Does that mean limiting the movement even more than it is now? At present the Native, at anyrate, has the right to come along and try his luck. Does that not mean that he has to be prevented from that to some extent? - No, I would not prevent him from trying his luck. I may say, Mr. Chairman, that I have not fully thought out these things. I would like them to come and try,

Joint Council

but I would not like Natives who are not capable of getting employment on the new wage determination remaining indefinitely in Durban.

DR. ROBERTS: You would not stem them at the source?— I would, I think, by having Natives sent out from time to time. I would let them know what the position was. Now, in regard to Nyasaland, for instance, the Natives there are told whether they are able to find work or not. I would do the same in regard to the rural Natives here.

CHAIRMAN: You would not allow Natives to stay here indefinitely who could not secure work, but administratively that either means a very much more rigid system of attending to matters than the Natives today are accustomed to, it would mean a very much more rigid system of enforcing the pass laws or, alternatively, it would mean making it impossible ---- ?— I would only suggest a rigid scheme for the man who has not got permanent employment. I would do my best to see that something was done so that he would not permanently come and stay in the town.

Unfortunately, the colour of his skin will not change, - the colour of his skin will not shew whether it will be possible for him to get employment ?— No, that is so, but I am suggesting more rigid regulations for the man who has not got employment. Regulations for these men should apply differently from what they do to the men who have employment. I have not thought that out very carefully, but some such policy rather appeals to me.

Yes, but how are you going to distinguish between the man who cannot get employment and the man who can? You have 30,000 Natives here. You can only do it by having a very stringent system of passes for everyone. A man must be able to prove that he is employed and that must mean the

Joint Council

carrying of some document?- Yes, it is very complicated.

DR. ROBERTS: You would not allow the thing to work itself out, leaving ^{it} to the sense and the knowledge of the Natives, that is that they would not crowd into towns like Durban and Johannesburg knowing that they cannot find work ?- I do not know enough about country conditions. One point I am clear on is that every effort should be made to get a decent permanently resident population in Durban and, if the only way is by these rigid regulations, then I would be prepared to agree to that, although I would regret it.

CHAIRMAN: The creation of a permanent resident wage earning class is a thing which will no doubt develop as it is developing, but it will go very slowly. The problem is, what is one to do in the present transition stage? Is nothing else than more stringent regulations possible ?- You could improve conditions in the country; you could disseminate information through the magistrates often as to the conditions in Durban. The fact that the number of registered Natives in Durban has already dropped is proof that that is already having its effect.

DR. ROBERTS: Do you not think that that should take the place of rigid restrictions, leaving it to the good sense of the Natives ?- Yes, I would try that first, but if you found that you had a large casually employed degenerating mass of Natives attracted to the towns in the hope of getting higher wages, then I myself would be prepared to acquiesce in something which made it possible to achieve that fairly well paid permanently well paid population.

CHAIRMAN: Probably we have that situation now, that there is a very large casual population drifting in and out.

Joint Council

If you had to count every individual every time he came in to work in every town in the Union once a year, you would probably get several times as big a figure as the population at present. They are drifting in and out and there is a great deal of degeneracy accompanied with it ?- In Durban, we put every restriction in the way of the permanent wage-earning population. For one thing, we do not provide them with housing. The general idea of employers is that Natives have this subsidy from their tribal life and public opinion generally is in favour of maintaining the Natives in their tribal state and, whether it is deliberate or not, in the towns it works out in this way, that the tribal reserves provide a very large convenient reservoir of labour. I am anxious to see that the reverse should be the case. It may take time and it may cause hardship, but the effect will be good in the end.

But the nett result is that segregative legislation would have to go by the board ?- You mean, different laws for Natives and Europeans ...

No; the attempt to move the Native population, as far as the great bulk is concerned, into certain well defined areas ?- Well, my view, Mr. Chairman, is that segregation anyhow is impossible. I associate myself entirely with the views which were recently expressed on this point by Professor Brooks.

Now, in the matter of public policy, to get some sort of order out of a tangle of racial relations, would you would have to visualise a permanent Native urban population living, perhaps, in a segregated area, but in close contact with the great towns, and, as far as the rural population is concerned,

Joint Council

you may segregate them into their area, but they should not be portions of one whole as they are now? - No, I think the present relationship between the 'uncultivation' in the reserves, due to the absence of the males for so many weeks or months in the year, and subsidising of wages in town, owing to the fact of these uncultivated reserves giving a partial subsidy, is a most unfortunate circumstance. It means on the one hand underpaid and inefficient labour in the town, and on the other hand wasting of whole areas which, as a result of the absence of the men, are not cultivated.

So the point to start with is really improving the cultivation in such a way that those people shall not be forced into the towns to earn something to eke out a living?-- Yes, I do think that the people in the reserves should get an adequate living from the land and that the younger sons should be made to feel that they have to look for some permanent source of employment in industry; they should be encouraged to get full time employment in industry; because I do feel that you would have to have a generation of younger sons who would not all be able to remain on the land.

At present, of course, that is against the tribal Natives' whole way of thinking? - Yes. At present that is so, but one feels that something in that direction will have to be done.

So we should have to change his conception of what a good life is largely and substitute the needs for material things rather than the needs for leisure before we can bring that about; that would, of course, take a long time? - I admit that; I am not looking for these things to come about next year, but the trend of policy over a generation, -- a transition like that cannot take place

A transition like that cannot take place inside one generation? - No; quite possibly it would take two generations to come about.

In the meantime you will have a continuous conflict, caused by people continually moving out of one condition into a new condition which has not been adjusted to them?--Yes.

And therefore am I correct in thinking that the dissatisfaction must be expected to continue for a long time to come?--Yes, there is bound to be considerable friction. At the present time the belief, in Natal at all events, is so strong that the tribal system, the tribal policy is the right thing, that it is tending to hold us back inevitably and is causing more friction than is known.

Your point is that we should try to accelerate the transition from subsistence to money?--I am anxious that we should not impede it at any rate.

On the other hand the point has been put to us, particularly by native witnesses that the change which has gone on, has gone on much faster than the natives could adjust themselves to, and that the present position is due to that?--Has that evidence, may I ask, been given by native chiefs?

No, as a matter of fact by some fairly intelligent witnesses; I do not think the native chief would say it; but coming back to the point there; ~~the~~ effect ^{that} of this transition is causing problems all along the line must always create a certain amount of dissatisfaction...?--I agree.....

Dissatisfaction among the native population, and the native population is inclined to think that the European must be so clever as to know how to settle these things straight away. Is not that the position which we are ^{as that possible} faced with?--No, I think the native population must want more understanding of the position. The native population say we must provide them with more land. I do not think they understand the

difficulties of the position. They seem to imagine that we need only wave a wand and everything can be put right. On the other hand I do not think that a sufficient number of Europeans are giving that aspect or that question ^{that} careful attention in the interest of the natives which they should do.

DR. ROBERTS: You do not think surely that the native who is urging for more land does not understand the position; what he is wanting is to put his terms as high as possible so that in the end he will get something; he asks for a lot, in the hope of getting something-- perhaps less than what he is asking for?--¹ do not think myself that they fully grasp the position, but in a country where commercialism is practised as it is in South Africa it is considered that it would be a retrograde step to extend tribal reserves. I do not think myself that the natives understand that.

I will accept that for Natal, but not for other parts of the Union?--(No answer).

CHAIRMAN: We must take it then that for a considerable time to come the native must be dissatisfied with the way in which the European population treats him?-- Yes, I think so.

Assuming that we used every effort to minimise that dissatisfaction, can you see any escape from the position that the native population must for a long time not understand the position and must assume that the Europeans do not give them a fair deal?--That is so, but I do not think that the Europeans are giving sufficient attention to the problem.

Supposing the position were eased in a way, supposing it were eased in the matter of obviously congested areas, eased in the direction of growth and numbers, do you think that the natives would in the meantime find enough relief to

leave the other problems, which it will take at least another 50 years to solve, in the background?--That is a question on a matter of opinion. I would answer it in this way. If the native saw that a genuine attempt was made to consider his difficulties and to regard him as a permanent and necessary part of the population in this country, whose welfare was to be considered as much as that of the Europeans, I think the situation would then ease itself. You can see from the evidence which some of our native witnesses gave here how the wage policy rankles. If it were admitted as part of the policy of South Africa that natives were entitled to economic progress, I think the situation would be very considerably eased. That is my opinion.

Could that economic progress be on a basis of fairly considerable lack of restriction----- would not certain layers (?-) have to be opened at a time and others have to be closed, so as to make the thing go in an easier way, instead of the present rabble?-- You mean that if certain occupations were opened to them from which they are now debarred.....

Let us say the building of native locations.....?-- I think that would help, but unless you are building native locations on a scale, on a pretty considerable scale, it would not take you far. If it were confined, as I heard it suggested, to the building in Durban of 100 more houses, well, it would not take you very far, would it?

DR. ROBERTS: You do not think that you are perhaps exaggerating both the lack of knowledge of the native and his lack of ability for adjusting himself to the conditions that must finally find an equilibrium?--I do not want to be

understood as meaning that individual natives are not capable of it. I was immensely struck with what this young Fort Hare student did, this young fellow Selby Ngeobo, whose statement on native unemployment you have before you; he did very good work for us. I do not want, what I said to apply to the Revd. Mr. Dube, for instance, but even the European did not understand the difficulty of economic adjustment.

If you base your evidence, if you apply it to the far off villages, good and well-- but unless there is a large enough constituency throughout the country----- would you be willing to accept it at that?--Well, I do not think there is enough economic knowledge among the Europeans to face these difficulties. We cannot even deal with our own problems of unemployment; how then can we expect the natives....

Quite so, then why should you embark on a system of repression?-- I do not think I am doing that; I was very unwillingly forced by the Chairman to admit that in certain circumstances administrative restrictions might have to be taken.

You do not think these conditions exist?--I do think so.

Ignorance....?--^{Yes}, they do exist....

But not to such an extent as to warrant these extra conditions. These extra conditions that would be enforced would be enforced because of a common ignorance of the people. Is that not so?--I do not quite follow that. I was asked by the Chairman if I did not think the natives would still continue to be dissatisfied whatever policy was adopted...

No, I am referring to your advocacy of extra passes?-- I am not sufficiently in touch with rural thought to be able to say whether the natives could understand the position.

Do not you think that if there were definite knowledge

put before the natives in the various outlying parts, which is not done just now that they would do as they are asked to do, because they are a very law abiding people; assuming they were told what the position in the towns was in regard to labour being available?--, would certainly try it at first.

Would you try it intensively?--Yes.

Would you have it done by policemen and magistrates and schools telling them "don't come to Durban"?--Yes, and I would send one of their own men round to explain to them what was likely to happen to an unemployed native in Durban.

I understood you to say that you were willing to embark immediately on a system of extra repression?--I think I guarded myself very carefully. I said that if it were possible to do it in any other way..... I said "only as a last resort". I tried to make myself clear on that.

CHAIRMAN: Coming to the main question which seems to me to be at the root of the problem, the natives of the present day, judging from the evidence which has been placed before this Commission, claim a width and variety of things, which anyone can see, cannot all be conceded, simply because they cannot be paid for, and the point I want to get at is this-- if one releases the burden in a certain directions, whether the tide would be only so strong that it could only fill certain avenues, a number at a time, or whether it would still continue pressing on the measures and alterations which must inevitably be applied as long as the economic worth of the native is as low as it is at present?--I do not think anyone can answer that question.

It is a question of vision, I know?--My own opinion is

JOINT COUNCIL.

~~6354.~~
XXX.

that I do not think it is worth very much because it is dealing with a very complicated situation in the future; my own opinion is that if the native felt that some definite attempt was made to regard him as a permanent factor, if he realised that his welfare was being considered, he would respond to that attempt. If he realised that we looked upon him as, may I call it a co-operating factor, instead of a dangerous element to be suppressed, I feel sure he would respond.

MR. LUCAS: Is not it a fact that natives from the tribal areas only come to the towns when they are compelled to do so by economic pressure?--Yes, I think that is so, but in some areas this economic pressure is pretty constant. I made some enquiries in this connection at the Inanda Mission Reserve during Christmas and I was told that practically no family could exist there with any degree of comfort unless they had one of their men working in Durban. That is one instance of constant economic pressure forcing men out to go and work in the towns.

So that the pressure is there and about as many of these men are going out to work in the towns as can possibly go out. And it is this pressure which is driving them out, no matter what else....?--No, I think if the wages were raised the attractions would be greater.

The question is: do the natives come to the towns because of the level of wages in the towns or because of the fact that they are compelled to go out?--You are eliciting the question whether the raising of native wages brings more natives out to the towns....

The only town where there has been a determination affecting a substantial number of natives is Bloemfontein

JOINT COUNCIL.

~~6355.~~

and there has not been a great influx there?--Well, Mr. Lucas, the newspapers do not say that.

Are we not rather accepting as a fact what is only an assumption that more natives come in because the level of wages is raised?--Yes, that may be; but I was accepting it partly because the newspapers have reported it.

We have asked a lot of questions on it, but there has been no evidence?--Well, I partly accepted it because I would assume that a higher wage would attract a larger number of these people to the town.

Is not the point which I put to you first also reasonable that natives only go out when they require money and that all those who require money have to go out now?--I do not know. I do not think anyone could answer that; we should have to wait and see.

Does not it seem to you that there is no ground for the assumption, for the belief that a rise in wages will mean an influx of natives?--Well, I do not know.

I put it to you that probably all that go out are driven out to-day and no more would be driven out if the wages were made any higher?--Fewer might possibly be driven out, as you put it.

Have you made any investigation about the other point, about the native who does go out staying out a shorter time?--No, I tried to get information but I was not able to get any.. I was told last year by one of the managers of the compound that the natives stayed in Durban very much longer than they used to do. It might be useful to have evidence on that aspect, whether the period of natives doing service in

Collection Number: AD1438

NATIVE ECONOMIC COMMISSION 1930-1932, Evidence and Memoranda

PUBLISHER:

Collection funder:- Atlantic Philanthropies Foundation

Publisher:- Historical Papers Research Archive

Location:- Johannesburg

©2013

LEGAL NOTICES:

Copyright Notice: All materials on the Historical Papers website are protected by South African copyright law and may not be reproduced, distributed, transmitted, displayed, or otherwise published in any format, without the prior written permission of the copyright owner.

Disclaimer and Terms of Use: Provided that you maintain all copyright and other notices contained therein, you may download material (one machine readable copy and one print copy per page) for your personal and/or educational non-commercial use only.

People using these records relating to the archives of Historical Papers, The Library, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, are reminded that such records sometimes contain material which is uncorroborated, inaccurate, distorted or untrue. While these digital records are true facsimiles of paper documents and the information contained herein is obtained from sources believed to be accurate and reliable, Historical Papers, University of the Witwatersrand has not independently verified their content. Consequently, the University is not responsible for any errors or omissions and excludes any and all liability for any errors in or omissions from the information on the website or any related information on third party websites accessible from this website.

This document is part of the archive of the South African Institute of Race Relations, held at the Historical Papers Research Archive at the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa.